Abortion Industry Negligence Nationwide: Highlighting the Most Egregious Offenses

Kentucky (2016)
- A new Planned Parenthood facility in Louisville had been doing both medical and surgical abortions for over a month without being licensed by the state.¹

Massachusetts (2016)
- In February, two women accused Dr. Roger Ian Hardy, the medical director of Fertility Centers of New England, of sexual assault.²
  - One plaintiff, a 40-year-old Marlborough woman, alleged that Hardy assaulted her in September 2013, while she was under anesthesia for an egg retrieval procedure. In her complaint, she said she experience “severe vaginal trauma and bleeding.”
  - The second woman, who also planned to sue, claimed that Hardy inappropriately touched her during an ultrasound imaging test of her uterus.
- In another related incident, a woman reported that Hardy had inappropriately touched her in 1999, when he worked at Women’s Health Associates in Wellesley.
- In January 2014, Hardy resigned his medical license during a Board of Registration in Medicine investigation. Since then, Hardy has moved to Thailand and declined interviews.

Missouri (2016)
- On January 30, 2016, a patient was taken by ambulance from a Planned Parenthood in St. Louis to a hospital. This is the thirtieth such incident since 2009.³
- Mary Kogut, President and CEO of Planned Parenthood of the St. Louis Region and Southwest Missouri, fails to comply with subpoenas issued in November 2015 by a state senate committee. The committee issued the subpoena for Planned Parenthood documents as a part of the state’s investigation following undercover videos released by the Center for Medical Progress.⁴

Nebraska (2016)
- In February, ambulances arrived at least three times within three months while LeRoy Carhart was on duty at his abortion facility in Bellevue. Video shows Carhart and his wife leaving the facility with suitcases and exiting the parking lot as the ambulance transports the woman. Carhart has not had hospital privileges anywhere since 1982.⁵

California (2015)

- On March 31, a woman in Bakersfield was transported by ambulance from Family Planning Associates abortion clinic to San Joaquin Hospital.  
- Clinic workers blocked the incident with sheets. 
- This was the second time this year an ambulance was called to the clinic and the seventh medical emergency for the clinic since 2012.

Florida (2015)

- Inspections ordered by Gov. Rick Scott of all 16 Planned Parenthood centers in the state revealed three facilities (St. Petersburg, Fort Myers, and Naples) performed 2nd trimester abortions which they were not licensed to perform, and one (Pembroke Pines) did not keep proper records on disposing fetal remains.  
- A Woman’s World Medical Center in Fort Pierce was cited for 68 pages of violations over the course of 5 years. 
  - The clinic was cited twice in one year for failing to maintain sterilized-functioning instruments. During second-trimester abortions, patients’ vital signs were not monitored. Administrative assistants without certification performed ultrasound examinations on women. 
  - A Woman’s World did not have written procedures for preventative maintenance, pre- and post-operative care, emergency measures, incident reports, and medical-record keeping. The clinic was also cited twice for lacking orientation and in-service training.

Illinois (2015)

- According to an Illinois Right to Life study, 63% of licensed women’s clinics in the state have not received a health and sanitary inspection from two to three-and-a-half years. 
- Additionally, 40% of licensed abortion clinics went 14 to 17 years without health inspections, 26.7% went 9 to 13 years without health inspections and 20% went 5 to 7 years without health inspections. 
- The Illinois Department of Public Health does not have any policy for sanitary inspections of licensed women’s clinic. 
- Illinois Right to Life detailed 66 pages of problems of negligence and incompetence within Illinois facilities, including failure to employ a registered nurse; failure to conduct pre-anesthesia evaluations of some patients; and storage of medications, fetal tissue and food in the same biohazard laboratory refrigerator.

Maryland (2015)

- Steven Brigham reopened three abortion facilities in Maryland, despite never being licensed to practice medicine in the state. The facilities had been shut down by the state in 2013 for dangerous abortion practices, including the death of a patient.

---

9 http://illinoisrighttolife.org/womens-health-comes-first-a-project-of-illinois-right-to-life/find-your-clinic/  
o Maria Santiago, a patient under Brigham’s care, died after suffering cardiac arrest. None of the clinic staff used a defibrillator because it did not work, and no one had been properly trained.

➢ The clinics avoided the re-licensing requirements by only offering medication abortions.
➢ Brigham’s medical license was either revoked, relinquished or suspended in five states.
  o New York revoked Brigham’s license for “gross negligence” and “bad judgment,” following two botched late-term abortions, which threatened the patients’ lives and required emergency surgery.
  o Brigham circumvented abortion laws by beginning the procedure in New Jersey and then transferring patients to New York.
  o Previously, Brigham also employed unlicensed nurses and a registered sex offender.

**Michigan (2015)**

➢ Local, state and federal officials have been investigating OB/GYN doctor Michael Roth, after he was cited by the state for performing illegal home abortions.\(^\text{14}\)

➢ At least a dozen jars of what were believed to be human tissue and a powerful anesthetic were found in the truck of Roth’s car.\(^\text{15}\)

**New Jersey (2015)**

➢ Steven Brigham has been operating a string of clinics in New Jersey and Maryland, despite losing his license for “gross negligence” and being required to divest himself from the American Women’s Services clinics he owned. Ownership was supposedly transferred to Vikram Kaji, an OB/GYN, who was one of Brigham’s associates.\(^\text{16}\)
  o On April 22, Kaji denied he was the owner of a Hamilton clinic during an unannounced inspection. Again on May 5, Kaji testified under oath that he was not the owner.
  o On June 16, a complaint was issued by Deputy Attorney General Bindi Merchant, accusing Kaji, of fraud for claiming he had assumed ownership of American Women’s Service.

➢ Brigham illegally performed late-term abortions for five women by administering a drug that kills the unborn child. Patients then drove to his Maryland clinic for the surgical procedure.

**Pennsylvania (2015)**

➢ In November, state inspectors found aborted babies’ remains in a janitor’s closet at the Far Northeast Planned Parenthood facility in Philadelphia. At the Locust Street Planned Parenthood, they also found aborted babies’ remains in undated bags.\(^\text{17}\)

**South Carolina (2015)**

➢ Three abortion facilities were cited for violations including dumping aborted babies’ remains into landfills rather than incinerating them as required by law.\(^\text{18}\)

---


2014

Alabama (2014)
- In November 2014, the state health department found during an onsite inspection that Planned Parenthood of Alabama in Mobile had “failed to report reasonable suspected abuse or neglect for a minor” among other violations. The Director of Patient Services “verified a report was not made.” The girl was a 14-year-old victim of rape, and ultimately had two abortions within four months.”

Florida (2014)
- Two women were injured at Venice Women’s Health Center in Port Charlotte, Florida.
  - On June 3, one woman, described as Caucasian and in her early 30s, was transported to the hospital for emergency care.
  - Earlier that day, an abortion patient was seen leaving in poor condition and unable to walk on her own. Clinic staff did not support her, but she was helped to the car by a male companion. She appeared in significant pain and fully reclined her seat in the car.
- In 2012 at the clinic, Ali Azima performed a late-term abortion, for which the facility was not licensed. The patient was then transferred to Azima’s other clinic, Southwestern Florida Women’s Clinic (SFWC) in Fort Myers, where the abortion was completed. The citation for the incident was issued to SFWC.
- SWFC was also cited for multiple health and safety violation in 2012.
  - The autoclave was not being properly cleaned, and consequently, surgical instruments were not properly sterilized.
  - The standard of care for first-trimester surgical abortion practices was not met.
  - A second inspection found the facility still failed to properly clean the autoclave and sterilize surgical instruments.

Ohio (2014)
- In March, Lakisha Wilson died seven days after being taken by ambulance from Preterm abortion clinic in Cleveland. She had been five months pregnant.
- According to 911 call records, Wilson was not breathing at the clinic.
- In March 2012, an investigation found that Preterm failed to ensure complete medical records from one patient were transported with them to the hospital after the patient had increased bleeding.
- In July 2012, state inspectors found that Preterm was not keeping track of employees’ current Ohio licenses, registrations and certifications in their personal files.

Oklahoma (2014)
- In December, Dr. Nareshkumar Patel was arrested for fraud, following an undercover investigation.
  - Dr. Patel gave all three non-pregnant undercover detectives RU-486 after performing ultrasounds and telling them that they were pregnant.
  - The investigation began after a complaint was filed by the sister of a former patient who paid for a medical abortion procedure in August 2011.

Pamela King, the former patient, died four months later of cervical cancer complications. Her doctor reported that at the time of her death, she had not been pregnant within the last year.

In 1992, Patel was investigated for burning 55 aborted fetuses in a field east of Shawnee.

Virginia (2014)

- Steven Brigham, who was not a licensed medical practitioner, operated abortion clinics in Fairfax and Virginia Beach.\(^{24}\)
- In March, an inspection of the Virginia Beach clinic found that in January alone, 18 of 44 women who visited the clinic faced complications. Violations also included improper hygiene and unsanitary injection practices.

2013

Delaware (2013)

- On April 9, ABC Philadelphia news reported that two former nurses at the Planned Parenthood of Delaware abortion facility quit their jobs, citing unsafe, unsanitary conditions, and “a meat-market style of assembly-line abortions.”\(^{25}\)
- On May 29, Jayne Mitchell-Werbrich and Joyce Vasikonis testified before the Delaware state senate. They referred to the clinic conditions as “ridiculously unsafe” and noted that women were at risk for hepatitis and AIDS.
- In the months since January 2013, five women were sent to the hospital with complications from botched abortions.\(^{26}\)

Maryland (2013)

- In May, the Maryland Department of Health and Mental Hygiene reported that 12 of the 16 abortion clinics in the state failed to meet state safety regulations.\(^{27}\)
  - Violations included “failure to maintain a sanitary environment at all times and to consistently use chemical indicator strips in sterilized equipment packing,” “failure to obtain information about the professional credentials of physicians on staff” and “failure to include a discharge diagnosis in the medical record.”
  - At four clinics, non-physicians routinely distributed an abortion-inducing drug to women who had not been seen by a physician and who were up to 11 weeks pregnant.
  - At one clinic, staff had inadequate certification, including one registered nurse whose license had expired, nurses who were not properly trained to administer sedation drugs and staff who had not been trained for the emergency transfer of patients.
- State officials suspended surgical abortions at three clinics owned by Associates in OB/GYN Care for issues related to the ability to respond to life-threatening problems during surgery.\(^{28}\)
  - At the Baltimore clinic, a patient suffered cardiac arrest and subsequently died at a hospital. The physician who performed the abortion was not CPR-certified and a defibrillator at the clinic did not work.
  - At the Silver Spring clinic, a patient was left alone for three minutes after waking up, leaving her at risk of falling and injuring herself.

---


At the Landover clinic, the nurse was untrained in using the defibrillator or suction machine. Furthermore, the pads on the defibrillator machine were expired.

**Nebraska (2013)**
- State Attorney General Jon Bruning filed a medical disciplinary petition against Lindsey Creekmore, a registered nurse at a Bellevue abortion clinic, operated by Dr. LeRoy Carhart.29
- Creekmore was accused of administering incorrect dosages of intravenous sedatives and a labor-inducing drug to 11 patients from January 2011 to March 2012.
- According to the complaint, the clinic also routinely failed to have licensed medical staff present in its recovery room, a violation of state law.

**Pennsylvania (2013)**
- On May 13, abortionist Kermit Gosnell was found guilty of the murder of three newborn children and the negligent death of one patient.30
  - He had been charged with eight counts of murder including seven babies who were born alive and then killed with scissors. Prosecutors said that he made millions of dollars over 30 years, performing as many illegal, late-term abortions as he could.31

**Texas (2013)**
- In May, Operation Rescue released a report revealing that 3 former staff members of the Aaron Women’s Clinic in Houston had come forward with evidence of horrific late term abortions conducted by abortionist Douglas Karpen.32
- The informants provided photographic evidence (taken on their cell phones) of illegal late-term abortions. The photos depicted two babies aborted well beyond Texas’ legal limit of 24 weeks. Their necks had been cut. The physical condition of the babies revealed that they had likely been born alive and then subsequently killed.33
- Testimony from the former workers indicated that Dr. Karpen was committing both very late term abortions and infanticide. Patients would be administered doses of Cytotec, a drug that causes strong and unpredictable uterine contractions, to induce labor, and then he would proceed with the abortion.
- “When he did an abortion, especially an over 20 week abortion, most of the time the fetus would come completely out before he cut the spinal cord, or he introduced one of the instruments into the soft spot of the fetus in order to kill the fetus,” stated former surgical assistant Deborah Edge. According to Edge, this was a common occurrence.

**Virginia (2013)**
- On June 27, a woman was taken away by ambulance from Nova Women’s Health Center in Falls Church. She was hyperventilating and in need of advanced life support.
- Following this event, on August 2, the Falls Church facility underwent a licensing inspection, and it was concluded that the facility violated a number of codes.34

---

Nova Women’s Health Center, the busiest abortion clinic in Virginia, closed when its lease was terminated via a lawsuit by the property owners on the grounds that the abortion clinic created a public nuisance.

According to the lawsuit filings, Nova patients were regularly inside the building “lying down in corridors…and, in some instances, even vomiting.” One filing said witnesses would testify that this was a daily occurrence.35

Previously in 2007, the state Board of Health reported evidence of negligence and abuse at Nova Women’s Health Center clinic including: failing to provide follow-up care, keeping inadequate records, and improperly handling and dispensing drugs. Abortionist Mi Yong Kim was forced to surrender her medical license, but continued to operate the clinic.36

**West Virginia (2013)**

Itai Gravely, a 26-year-old woman, filed suit against the Women’s Health Center of West Virginia and abortionist Rodney Lee Stephens after Stephens allegedly forced Ms. Gravely to proceed with an abortion against her will and then left her dead baby’s head inside her womb.37

- Ms. Gravely changed her mind about the abortion after adequate anesthesia could not be administered.
- Dr. Stephens ordered clinic workers to physically restrain Ms. Gravely as he proceeded with the abortion.
- The next day, Ms. Gravely was rushed to the emergency room where it was discovered that dismembered body parts of her child had been left in her womb.

**Alabama (2012)**

- January: The New Woman All Women abortion facility in Birmingham sent three women with botched abortions to the hospital. Paramedics had to hand-lift a partially clad woman through a narrow doorway and down several steps because the building did not have a gurney-accessible entrance.38

- The Alabama Department of Public Health issued a 76-page deficiency report citing the following among other violations.39
  - Clinic staff was not properly trained to provide safe quality patient care.
  - Failure to have policy and procedures related to medication administering and errors. This resulted in the hospitalization of three abortion patients on January 21, 2012, with one patient placed in ICU.
  - There was no documentation that the two abortionists employed by Derzis were even qualified to do abortions.
  - Abortionists made illegible notations on patient charts, which made determining critical information about patient care impossible. In several case, the notes about patient care and conditions were completely false.

---

37 [http://www.adfmedia.org/News/PRDetail/8246](http://www.adfmedia.org/News/PRDetail/8246)
**Colorado (2012)**
- Planned Parenthood Rocky Mountains performed an abortion on a 13-year-old girl without questioning her upon learning her age or reporting possible sexual abuse by her stepfather, who was later convicted. A lawsuit was filed against the center by four unidentified employees on behalf of the girl.\(^{40}\)

**Florida (2012)**
- A Woman’s Option in Hialeah was fined $200 13 times from 2008 to 2012 for failing to submit monthly reports on the abortions it performed.\(^{41}\)
- In 2009, the clinic also failed to get parental consent for a minor’s abortion and to employ a licensed physician as medical direction, which are violations of Florida law.
- The clinic was voluntarily dissolved in May 2011.

**Florida (2011)**
- July: Abortionist James Scott Pendergraft IV was party to a lawsuit in which the jury awarded the plaintiff $36.7 million in damages. The suit stemmed from a 2001 botched abortion in which a baby girl was born alive and subsequently suffered lifelong handicaps.\(^{42}\)
- Pendergraft’s medical license had been suspended 5 times, yet he continued to profit from 5 different Florida abortion mills.\(^{43}\)
- **2013**: The Florida Board of Medicine indefinitely suspended his medical license and closed one of his Orlando abortion clinics. After merely paying a fine, Pendergraft reopened the clinic and continued to perform late term abortions 7 days a week.\(^{44}\)
- **Oct 2015**: The traveling abortionist who was arrested in South Carolina as the result of a traffic stop is identified as the notorious Florida abortionist James Scott Pendergraft IV.\(^{45}\)
  - “At the time of his arrest on October 5, 2015, Pendergraft had in his possession surgical implements that were covered in blood and human tissue from abortions he had illegally performed throughout South Carolina. He was also in the possession of illegal narcotics.”

**Illinois (2011)**
- In September, state officials conducted an inspection of Women’s Aid Clinic in Lincolnwood and found 15 state health and safety violations at the clinic, including failure to have a registered nurse supervise patient care, failure to properly track narcotics and sedatives, failure to dispose of expired medication, and failure to ensure “a sanitary facility with all equipment in good working order.”\(^{46}\)
- Following the inspection, the clinic received a $36,000 fine for Antonesha Ross’s care (see “Illinois 2009” below) and the reported violations. Larisa Rozansky, the owner, did not pay, and Women’s Aid Clinic closed three weeks later in November.
- In December, Rozansky formed a new clinic, called Women’s Aid Center, which had two of the same phone numbers and for a time, the same website and location.

---


New Jersey (2011)

- February: An employee of Planned Parenthood of Central Jersey in Perth Amboy was caught on videotape by Live Action aiding and abetting an undercover investigator posing as a sex trafficker of minor girls as young as 13.47
  - Amy Woodruff referred the alleged pimp and prostitute to the Metropolitan Medical Association if ever in need of an abortion because “their protocols aren’t as strict as ours and they don’t get audited the same way that we do.”
  - When asked how long after the abortion the girls had to wait before engaging in sex again, Woodruff said to abstain for a “minimum of 2 weeks.” When asked what the girls could do to make money, Woodruff advised, “Waist up, or just be that extra action walking by.”
- Woodruff was fired after Live Action’s investigation became public.48

2010

Florida (2010)

- Inspectors reported the same violations cited in 2008 at A Woman’s Choice in Miami regarding improper training for patient care. They also cited the clinic for lacking a defibrillator and having an unmaintained emergency crash cart, expired supplies, expired medication and inadequate instruments.49
- All Women’s Clinic in Fort Lauderdale was cited for not reporting a uterine perforation within ten days of the injury. The perforation occurred during an abortion procedure, when a tube penetrated the woman’s uterus.50

Maryland (2010)

- April: An 18-year-old New Jersey woman was critically injured during an abortion at a Steven Chase Brigham clinic in Elkton, MD. She was airlifted to Baltimore hospital from Brigham’s facility.51
- The Maryland Board of Physicians found that the woman, who was 21 weeks pregnant, had first been treated in Voorhees, N.J. where her cervix was dilated. She was then told to drive 60 miles in her car to Elkton, MD, so doctors could complete the abortion. After her uterus ruptured, state officials said, she was put into a rented Chevy Malibu and driven to Union Hospital in Elkton.52
- The Maryland Board of Physicians stated that the patient was slumped in a wheelchair, nearly unconscious, outside the emergency room while Riley argued with hospital staff, who demanded their identities before treating the woman.
- Elkton police searched the clinic but could not find medical records for the woman. During the search, police did find 35 late-term fetuses, some 20 to 35 weeks old, in a freezer.
- The abortionists involved, Dr. Nicola Riley and Dr. Steven Chase Brigham, are now prohibited from practicing in Maryland. Dr. Riley's medical license was suspended in September 2010 by Maryland authorities. Dr. Brigham, who did not even have a Maryland license, was barred from practicing in the state.

Michigan (2010)

- February: The bodies of 17 aborted babies were discovered in a business dumpster outside the WomansChoice abortion clinic near Lansing. Investigations revealed that the owners were Richard and

47 http://liveaction.org/blog/planned-parenthood-aids-sex-ring/
50 Ibid.
Maggie Remund, owners of another clinic where the bodies of 47 aborted babies were discovered in a dumpster in 1989.\textsuperscript{53}

- Additionally, the business dumpster contained medical records, including patient logs with full names and insurance information, bloody surgical material, and used urine specimen cups labeled with the names of the patients.

**Illinois (2009)**

- On May 2, Antonesha Ross went to Women’s Aid Clinic in Lincolnwood for a first-trimester abortion. The examining doctor found she had an upper respiratory infection, swelling in her throat and “beefy red” tonsils. Ross was told she could not receive an abortion until she was further examined and treated.\textsuperscript{54}
- On May 8, 2009, Ross returned to the clinic. A doctor and nurse anesthetist performed the 12-week abortion without verifying that Ross had been treated and without re-examining her for an upper respiratory infection.
  - After the surgery, Ross had trouble breathing and coughed up fluid and blood. Employees called an ambulance 40 minutes after the surgery, but they did not perform CPR on Ross, according to state records.
  - Paramedics treated Ross on site before she was taken by ambulance to Presence St. Francis Hospital. At 3:05 p.m., she was pronounced dead in the emergency room, according to 911 and medical examiner records.
  - According to the Cook County assistant medical examiner, Ross died because of severe bronchopneumonia, which filled her lungs with fluid.

**Florida (2008)**

- In September 2008, the Agency for Health Care Administration (AHCA) conducted an unannounced inspection of A Woman’s Choice clinic in Miami. Inspectors found that the clinic did not train personnel to provide proper care to patients undergoing second-trimester abortions. The clinic also failed to keep adequate personnel records, lead orientation training or provide in-service training.\textsuperscript{55}
- In November, the AHCA inspectors returned unannounced and found no training deficiencies had been corrected.